

Public Document Pack



Tracey Lee
Chief Executive

Plymouth City Council
Civic Centre
Plymouth PL1 2AA

Please ask for Helen Wright, Democratic
Support

T 01752 304022

E helen.wright@plymouth.gov.uk

www.plymouth.gov.uk/democracy

3 May 2013

OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT BOARD SUPPLEMENT PACK

Wednesday 8 May 2013

5.00 pm

Council House, Plymouth (Next to the Civic Centre)

Members:

Councillor Mrs Aspinall, Chair

Councillor Tuffin, Vice Chair

Councillors Bowie, Bowyer, Casey, Philippa Davey, James, Monahan, Murphy, Mrs Nelder, Nicholson and Wigans.

Please find attached additional information for consideration under agenda items 3 and 12.

Tracey Lee
Chief Executive

OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT BOARD

AGENDA

PART I – PUBLIC MEETING

3. MINUTES (Pages 1 - 12)

The Management Board will be asked to agree the minutes of the meeting held on –

- 5 April 2013
- 17 April 2013

12. OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY ANNUAL REPORT 2012/13 (Pages 13 - 30)

The Board will consider the draft Overview and Scrutiny Annual Report 2012/13.

Overview and Scrutiny Management Board

Friday 5 April 2013

PRESENT:

Councillor Tuffin, Vice Chair, in the Chair.

Councillors Bowyer, Casey, Monahan, Mrs Nelder, Nicholson and Tuffin

Apologies for absence: Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Bowie, Philippa Davey, James, Murphy and Wigen.

Also in attendance: Giles Perritt (Head of Policy, Performance and Partnerships), Alison Seabeck (MP for Plymouth Moor View) and Helen Wright (Democratic Support Officer).

The meeting started at 1.30 pm and finished at 2.20 pm.

Note: At a future meeting, the committee will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

123. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no declarations of interest made by councillors in accordance with the code of conduct.

124. **CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS**

There were no items of Chair's urgent business.

125. **MEMBER OF PARLIAMENT FOR PLYMOUTH MOOR VIEW**

The Chair welcomed Alison Seabeck MP for Plymouth Moor View to the meeting. The Chair advised that following the success of the first meeting with the city's MPs, it was hoped that regular meetings could be held, to continue the joined up work at both local and national level. The Chair reported that Oliver Colvile MP for Plymouth Sutton and Devonport and Gary Streeter MP for South West Devon had sent their apologies for today's meeting.

- (a) Alison Seabeck, MP for Plymouth Moor View, provided an overview of current issues, which included –
 - the introduction of the welfare reforms and the phased implementation of Universal Credit;
 - the current situation in North Korea;
- (b) Parliament was currently in recess for Easter (26 March to 15 April 2013);

- (c) the Secretary of State for Transport, Patrick McLoughlin MP, would be visiting Exeter in May 2013 to look at the transport issues affecting the region;
- (d) work was progressing with both the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs and the Department for Transport on resolving the flooding issues on the rail line at Cowley Bridge.

In response to questions raised, it was reported that –

- (e) an engineering option had been put forward by the Environment Agency to construct a dam; however, this was not a feasible solution as this would close the rail line which was not acceptable;
- (f) Network Rail would be leading on the flooding solution for Cowley Bridge, in consultation with the Environment Agency; a number of options had been put forward however, concerns had been expressed by the Environment Agency regarding the displacement of water;
- (g) the Secretary of State for Transport had recently announced funding for specific schemes; however the scheme for Cowley Bridge had not been included; additional funding was available which could be allocated to the scheme, although at this stage the actual cost of such a project was unknown;
- (h) individuals, local authorities and businesses were encouraged to apply pressure to both Network Rail and the Environment Agency to achieve a workable solution to the flooding problems at Cowley Bridge;
- (i) it was considered a real achievement that there were no planned fire station closures as a result of the impact of the budget cuts for the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service; however, concerns were raised that future budget pressures would potentially impact service delivery in the city;
- (j) there was disappointment in the Government's decision not to introduce smaller fire tenders; the smaller appliances were more fuel efficient and would have reduced the running costs of the fleet;
- (k) the Chief Fire Officer had given an assurance that if there were a major incident within the city, neighbouring services would be called in to assist;
- (l) the city's MPs fully supported the Council's application for Plymouth's City Deal; MPs had lobbied Ministers and had also raised this matter at question time in the House of Commons;

- (m) the Growth and Infrastructure Bill had its third reading in the House of Lords; at this stage, amendments could be put forward regarding the permitted development rights;
- (n) the proposal to amend the terms of reference for the Low Pay Commission to allow it to either freeze or reduce the minimum wage would have a detrimental effect as it would take money out of the local economy;
- (o) the practical effect of the welfare reform for under occupation of social housing (dubbed the bedroom tax) had yet to be experienced; a number of amendments to the bill had been made which included a sum of £25m in Discretionary Housing payments that would be specifically targeted at disabled people who lived in significantly adapted properties.

The Chair thanked Alison Seabeck MP for attending the meeting.

126. **EXEMPT BUSINESS**

There were no items of exempt business.

This page is intentionally left blank

Overview and Scrutiny Management Board

Wednesday 17 April 2013

PRESENT:

Councillor Mrs Nelder, in the Chair.
Councillors Nicholson and Tuffin.

Also in attendance: Councillor Mary Aspinnall, Chair of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board, Lee Howell, Chief Fire Officer, Councillor George Gribble, Vice-Chairman, Pete Smith, Assistant Chief Fire Officer (Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service), Bob Walker, Chair (Fire Brigade Union), Chris Ziajka, Fire-fighter (Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service), Bill Grantham, Fire Safety Manager (Plymouth Community Homes), Scott Senior, Civil Protection Manager, Councillor Peter Smith, Deputy Leader, Councillor Gordon, appointed representative to the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service as an outside body, Giles Perritt, Lead Officer and Ross Johnston, Democratic Support Officer.

The meeting started at 4.00 pm and finished at 6.50 pm.

Note: At a future meeting, the committee will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

147. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no declarations of interest made in accordance with the Code of Conduct.

148. **CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS**

The Chair advised that there were currently insufficient members present for the meeting to be quorate. However, the group were not making any decisions today and it was hoped that one of the late arriving members would be present during agenda item 3.

149. **DEVON AND SOMERSET FIRE AND RESCUE SERVICE DRAFT PLAN 2013/14 TO 2014/15**

The Task and Finish Group met in order to scrutinise the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service Draft Plan 2013/14 to 2014/15 and, in particular, to safeguard the community by ensuring that the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service's budget reductions to the city were minimal.

As part of the evidence gathering process, members heard from officers from the Devon and Somerset Fire Authority, Plymouth City Council and Plymouth Community Homes, union representatives and councillors.

The full report and recommendations are attached as an appendix to these minutes.

(Councillor Nicholson joined the meeting at 4:45pm).

150. **EXEMPT BUSINESS**

There were no items of exempt business.

Appendix (Pages 3 - 8)

The Findings of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board Task and Finish Group to review the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service Draft Plan 2013/14 to 2014/15.

**DEVON AND SOMERSET FIRE AND
RESCUE SERVICE DRAFT PLAN 2013/14 TO
2014/15**

Findings of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board Task and
Finish Group



PLYMOUTH
CITY COUNCIL

CONTENTS

1. Introduction
2. Scrutiny Approach
3. Findings and Conclusions
4. Recommendations

I. INTRODUCTION

In early January 2013, as part of the budget scrutiny process, the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board received an update from the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service Authority on its Draft Plan 2013/14 to 2014/15 and were informed that –

‘The Government Grant had been reduced by 10.3 per cent in 2013 and a further 7.3 per cent in 2014 which represented a cut of £5.5 million. Members of the Authority would be considering the options at its meeting on 18 January 2013. A full public consultation would be undertaken prior to any decisions being made. A complete review of how services were delivered would be undertaken with a view to minimising the impact of any changes on public safety’.

The Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service presented its Draft Plan 2013/14 to 2014/15 and provided a further update to the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board at its meeting on 30 January 2013. Members discussed this issue at some length and it was apparent that –

‘whilst members acknowledged the need for change in the current economic climate, they had concerns at what those changes would mean for Plymouth, particularly given that it was a hazard rich city. It was therefore agreed that an Overview and Scrutiny Management Board task and finish group is set up to look at the draft plan in more detail and this will take place prior to closure of the consultation period in April in order that a formal response to the proposals can be submitted’.

Subsequently, a Project Initiation Document (PID) was drafted and submitted to the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board’s meeting on 13 March 2013, where it was agreed that a task and finish group be established.

This report summarises the findings of the task and finish group review and makes a number of proposals for the Deputy Leader of Plymouth City Council to consider in responding to the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service Service’s consultation on its Draft Plan.

2. SCRUTINY APPROACH

2.1 Task and Finish Group Objectives

The Task and Finish Group was asked to:

‘Safeguard the community by ensuring that the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service’s budget reductions to the city are minimal’.

2.2 Task and Finish Group Membership

The Task and Finish Group had cross party membership comprising the following Councillors –

- Councillor Nelder (Chair)
- Councillor Nicholson
- Councillor Tuffin
- Councillor Aspinall (present but not officially involved)

Councillor Aspinall was invited to participate in the discussion at the discretion of the Chair.

For the purposes of the review, the Task and Finish Group was supported by -

- Giles Perritt, Head of Policy, Performance and Partnerships
- Ross Johnston, Democratic Support Officer

2.3 Task and Finish Group Methodology

The Task and Finish Group convened on 17 April 2013 to consider evidence, hear from witnesses and review background information.

Witnesses invited:

- Lee Howell, Chief Fire Officer (Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Authority)
- Pete Smith, Assistant Chief Fire Officer (Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Authority)
- Councillor Gribble, Councillor Devon County Council (Vice Chair of the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Authority)
- Bob Walker, Chair (Fire Brigade Union)
- Chris Ziajka, Fire Fighter (Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Authority)
- Bill Grantham, Fire Safety Manager (Plymouth Community Homes)
- Scott Senior, Civil Protection Officer (Plymouth City Council)
- Councillor Peter Smith, Deputy Leader (Plymouth City Council)
- Councillor Gordon, Councillor Plymouth City Council (Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service's Resource Committee)

In order to assist with its deliberations, the task and finish group were provided with the following background material and documentation:

- Project Initiation Document
- Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service Draft Plan 2013/14 to 2014/15

3. FINDINGS

In reviewing the evidence and analysing all of the data provided, the group was of the opinion that:

- (a) the DSFRS did not adequately recognise the urbanised nature of Plymouth when preparing its Draft Plan;
- (b) the Draft Plan undervalued the importance of the Fire and Rescue Service within Plymouth, in particular through its lack of attention to Plymouth's Control of Major Accident Hazards (COMAH) sites, Greenergy and Valero Limited, and other major hazardous sites such as the Defence Munitions at Ernesettle and the Radiation (Emergency Preparedness and Public Information) Regulations 2001 (REPPPIR) site at Devonport Dockyard;
- (c) the Draft Plan failed to adequately identify the needs of the city's Fire and Rescue Service in dealing with other COMAH sites situated just outside of the city's boundaries, such as Calor Gas at Lee Mill and Thankes Tanks at Torpoint;
- (d) the Draft Plan's proposals inadequately dealt with Plymouth's requirements from a Fire and Rescue Service perspective, particularly with regards to the following:

- i. Proposal 1: Introduction of Light Rescue Pumps (LRPs);
This was considered to be detrimental to the Fire and Rescue Service's ability to deal with emergencies in Plymouth due to the reduction in fire fighters attending an emergency on the LRPs.
 - ii. Proposal 6: Dual crew the aerial appliance in Plymouth;
Moving from Weston-Mill based 'whole-time' fire fighters to become 'on call' fire fighters at Crownhill will have a negative knock-on effect for response times across the city and may result in the use of the aerial appliance being reduced.
 - iii. Proposal 7: Crew three fire engines in Plymouth as 'on call';
The East of the city, Plympton and Plymstock, will be severely impacted by the loss of 'whole-time' fire fighter crews to 'on-call' crews and this could have serious consequences for vulnerable persons living within this area;
- (e) Fire and Rescue Service response times were concerning, although it was acknowledged that initial response times would remain the same; the response times of back-up appliances could significantly change which was alarming;
 - (f) the prevention work of the DSFRS was encouraging, however this work should not be detrimental to the service's ability in dealing with any major emergencies;
 - (g) the DSFRS's consultation exercise was insufficient and did not effectively engage with partners or the citizens of Plymouth and to ensure that a more cohesive approach was adopted in consulting on and drafting future plans a more formal relationship should be established between the DSFRS and partner organisations.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS

The Overview and Scrutiny Management Board's Task and Finish Group reviewed the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service Draft Plan 2013/14 to 2014/15. Following analysis and a review of the evidence provided, members recommend to the Deputy Leader of Plymouth City Council the following proposals:

- I. That the Deputy Leader of Plymouth City Council in his response to the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service's (DSFRS) consultation rejects the DSFRS Draft Plan 2013/14 to 2014/15 for the following reasons:
 - a. Proposal 1: Introduction of Light Pumps – this is not a suitable appliance for the needs of Plymouth as an urban environment, and the reduction of fire fighters crewing these appliances could impact on the Fire and Rescue Service's ability to adequately deal with emergencies within the city;
 - b. Proposal 6: Dual crew the aerial appliance in Plymouth with 'on call' fire fighters – this proposal reduces the back-up response times to many of the city's areas and this is considered to put the West of the city at risk, particularly due to the risk posed by the Dockyard and Defence Munitions sites;
 - c. Proposal 7: Crew three fire engines in Plymouth as 'on call' rather than

‘whole-time’ – this proposal to remove ‘whole-time’ fire fighters to ‘on call’ fire fighters significantly puts at risk people living in the East of the city, particularly in the areas of Plympton and Plymstock, as well as detrimentally affecting the response times of any call-outs to Greenergy, Valero Limited, Cattedown, or the Calor Gas site, Lee Mill;

- d. the DSFRS’s requirement to achieve total savings of £11m by 2017 is acknowledged as being a difficult and untenable scenario, however, the proposed reduction of only £1.5m in back-office savings is inadequate, particularly given the extreme changes proposed to the front-line services in Plymouth;
 - e. alternative measures to achieve the total savings of £11m by 2017 have not been appropriately considered and it is suggested that the DSFRS’s Draft Plan is re-designed to consider rationalising its property assets within Plymouth rather than reduce the level of ‘whole-time’ fire fighters.
2. That the Deputy Leader of Plymouth City Council highlights the importance of a ‘whole-time’ operational Fire and Rescue Service for Plymouth and proposes that the DSFRS participates in an Integrated Planning Group to review and examine the impacts of the DSFRS Draft Plan 2013/14 to 2014/15 on Plymouth, prior to the Plan’s implementation date of July 2013.

ANNUAL SCRUTINY REPORT 2012/13



A report of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board on the achievements of Scrutiny for the 2012/13 municipal year

CONTENTS

Overview and Scrutiny Management Board	1
Children and Young People’s Overview and Scrutiny Panel.....	4
Customer and Communities Overview and Scrutiny Panel	6
Growth and Prosperity Overview and Scrutiny Panel	7
Health and Adult Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Panel	10
Support Services	13
Overview and Scrutiny Panel	13
Membership of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board and Panels.....	14

Overview and Scrutiny Management Board

Chair's Foreword

As Chair of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board, I am delighted to present the Overview and Scrutiny Annual Report for Plymouth City Council. It provides an account of the progress made by the Board and its Panels in the last 12 months, including some key pieces of work undertaken and challenges ahead.



Looking back on the past year

The last year has presented a number of challenges to the council's Scrutiny Panels and the Board in delivering against their objectives. There has been a change in administration of the council which has resulted in a commitment to become a Co-operative Council which will transform the delivery of council services. The council has also made a number of pledges across ten themes which it aims to deliver over the next two years. There has also been a number of key pieces of legislation that have been implemented that affect both local government and strategic partners of the city. The report summarises the achievements of the Panels and Board during the past year in contributing to these changes and also looks forward to the challenges ahead.

Budget Scrutiny

Each year we strive to improve the budget scrutiny process and I was particularly proud of this year which has, without doubt been the best budget scrutiny yet. The whole event was webcast live onto the internet for the first time and saw almost 300 live views on the first day alone. The two way challenge with partners was a

unique opportunity to gather City Leaders in this way and the fact that this session was webcast made the process even more open and transparent than ever before.

The budget scrutiny event took place over three days to consider the revenue and capital budgets for 2013/14 and the Corporate Plan 2012-2015. During this process the Board heard from partner organisations, the Leader of the council, Cabinet Members, directors and senior officers. Following the Board's robust challenge, it made a number of wide ranging recommendations to Cabinet; the majority of which were approved. Progress monitoring of the recommendations will be undertaken on a regular basis.

Thanks were given by the Leader for the considerable amount of work that the Board had undertaken and for the challenging sessions.

The Board is always looking at ways to improve the budget scrutiny process and as such will be looking to engage a wider range of witnesses.

Task and Finish Group

Following the budget scrutiny event, the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service Draft Plan 2013-14 to 2014-15 was published. The budget reductions contained within the Draft Plan had significant implications for Plymouth and as a result of these proposals the Board set up a task and finish group to look at safeguarding the community by ensuring that the service reductions to the city were minimal. A number of key witnesses including senior officers from the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service, Fire Brigade Union, Plymouth Community Homes and Plymouth City Council's Civil Protection Manager provided evidence to the group. Special thanks is given to the Civil Protection Manager for informing members of his concerns regarding the safety of the city. A number of recommendations were agreed and formed the basis of the council's submission to the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service's consultation process.

City's MPs Meetings

One of the key areas of work this year included the development of the Board's relationship with the city's MPs. The aim of this initiative was to create an environment to promote joined up working at both local and national level. Two meetings have now taken place, which have proved to be both extremely helpful and informative. One area of discussion has been the transport links to the region and in particular the city. Concerns at both local and national level have been raised regarding the rail link and the urgent solution to the flooding problem at Cowley Bridge, Exeter. As a result of lobbying, the Transport Minister will be visiting the area in May 2013 to view for himself the issues. Other issues that have been discussed include the council's application for the City Deal for Plymouth, which received cross party support from the city's MPs. Work will continue with the MPs with future meetings being scheduled in to the Board's work programme.

Cabinet Members

Over the past year, the Board has received regular updates from Cabinet Members on their respective portfolios. This has provided Members with an opportunity to ask in depth questions on areas of concern. As a result of a request from the Board, HR information, including staff sickness absence, has now been included within the corporate monitoring report. The inclusion of this information allows the Board to closely monitor the levels of staff sickness which are starting to fall.

Paperless Trial for Elected Members

The Board has championed a paperless office trial for elected members, which is a first for the Council. Documentation for the Council's constituted meetings is currently provided in paper copy. The aim of the trial is to improve the use of members' time, reduce the Council's carbon footprint and achieve savings. A number of the Board's business meetings have taken place trialling the new initiative which has received mixed reviews from members. This is a new and innovative way of working and any such change will take time to embed. A full report outlining the benefits and difficulties experienced with the trial will be submitted to the Deputy Leader of the Council, following the last meeting of the Board in May 2013.

Development

Over the past 12 months there have been a number of member development opportunities which have helped to expand members' knowledge and maximise the effectiveness of the scrutiny function. This has been achieved through training sessions and workshops which were delivered by an external facilitator.

Call-In

The Board held Cabinet to account by using the call in process to consider a Cabinet Member decision. Following questioning of the Cabinet Member and

officers, the Board referred the decision back to the Cabinet Member to reconsider.

Looking forward to next year

The changing landscape of the council provides new opportunities and challenges for scrutiny. As Chair, I was tasked with looking at ways of modernising the function, bringing it in line with the Council's priorities and also improving its effectiveness. As a result of this work, the overview and scrutiny function has been restructured and now includes a Cooperative Scrutiny Board and four panels (Your Plymouth, Working Plymouth, Ambitious Plymouth and Caring Plymouth), together with Select Reviews. One major change is the introduction of Co-operative Reviews; membership will be drawn from a pool of members who have expressed an interest in sitting on a review which is of particular interest to them. Another change will see the Chair being taken by a minority

party member. The new structure also better reflects the council's priorities. I am looking forward to the new structure being embedded and continuing to build on the success of this year's achievements.

And finally

I would like to take this opportunity to thank those who have contributed to the achievements that we have made this year. The Chairs, Vice Chairs and other members of the overview and scrutiny panels, together with their lead officers and democratic support officers who have been fundamental in delivering a large and varied scrutiny work programme. I could certainly not have managed throughout the year without the good humour and support from Giles Perritt (Head of Policy, Performance and Partnerships) as the lead officer together with Helen Wright (Democratic Support Officer).

Children and Young People's Overview and Scrutiny Panel

This section highlights the work, challenges and successes of the Children and Young People's Overview and Scrutiny Panel in 2012-2013.



Looking back on the past year

Special Educational Needs (SEN)

It is crucial for the family to be involved in the producing the statement that the family felt comfortable with which meant that cases going before an SEN Tribunal was low. Transport for children and young people with SEN was also reported and the panel were informed of the changes to how transport was provided.

16 - 19 Bursary Fund

700 young people previously applied for a bursary and this year around 900 young people had applied. The panel were informed that a criteria was used to decide how much would be awarded to a young person such as an income based assessment or if they were in receipt of free school meals. Discussions were taking place with secondary heads on how the bursary scheme would run and they were looking to review how the scheme was operating and how it could be improved by more corporate approaches to support young people such as providing bus passes and meals.

Alternative Complementary Education Provision

A reform of the services provided in Plymouth to support our most vulnerable children was undertaken. Ofsted were

satisfied with the changes made to the service and recognised that it would take time for improvements to embed. Weekend classes, workshops and social trips were organised for the children to ensure social interaction with peer groups and there was a growing culture nationally with parents choosing to exercise their rights to educate their children at home.

Early intervention

The early years safeguarding audit was undertaken and completed almost a year ago and training and guidance was put in place to address the issues raised from the audit. It was reported that sharing good practice was becoming embedded and 99 per cent of providers had completed and returned the forms. Concerns were raised by the panel that the report provided appeared not to show that procedures in place for the safeguarding of children for example the report only mentioned once the use of mobile phones. Because of the concerns raised a small working group met with the Early Years Safeguarding team to review further the training offered and to be reassured that the level of safety had increased. It was reported that members were very impressed with the procedures in place and how the swiftly the changes were implemented after the event.

School attainment

In general the performance in the city from early years to KS4 was lagging behind the national averages but was improving. It was important that the schools listen to the aspirations of the young people and the importance of teacher assessment as an integral part of helping to estimate future academic performance. A volunteer scheme 'Right to Read' was introduced to PCC employees and is a scheme for volunteers to sit with children and help with their reading. This scheme had been rolled out to a number of other organisations and was part of the wider offer to improve reading within the city.

Improving Service Delivery

Following a task and finish group on children's emotional wellbeing and mental health back in 2011, concerns were raised on the waiting times for treatment from the child and adolescent mental health service. The Chair invited Plymouth Community Healthcare (PCH) to attend panel meetings to provide regular updates on the progress made against the action plan. PCH informed the panel that their aim was to see young people within 18 weeks and on average young people were being seen with eight weeks of being referred. They highlighted issues of non-attendance at appointments and processes they would be putting in place to reduce the number of missed appointments. Some of the panel members took part in consultation on how the CAMHs service could be improved.

Monitoring of Sickness Levels and vacancies in Children's Social Care - the panel were informed of recruitment process for social workers and programme undertaken by newly qualified social workers during their first 12 months. Sickness was a high priority and management had robust processes in help when dealing with long term sickness.

Partnership and Stakeholder working

The panel received regular updates from the Children and Young People's Trust Board, Corporate Parenting Group and Plymouth Safeguarding Children's Board.

Looking forward to the next year

In 2013 – 2014 municipal year the scrutiny panel will seek to promote the children and young people of the city further and improve services for children and young people by working in partnership with Cabinet Members, Senior Officers and external stakeholders and scrutinising issues including:

- School meals/catering service
- SEN – autistic needs
- CAMHs
- Children Services Budget
- Youth Service Restructure
- Foster Carer Training

Task and Finish Groups

Dyslexia – to investigate and gain and understanding of how many children and young people across the city are dyslexic and to ascertain from schools on how they identify and support children with dyslexia.

Youth Unemployment – a joint task and finish with Growth and Prosperity to scrutinise youth unemployment, in particular, how successful young people with special educational needs and disabilities are in gaining employment. Representatives from health should also be invited to attend the meeting.

The panel will attempt to establish improved partnership working with other agencies and bodies to champion further the city's growth agenda, and further improve its alliance with the Plymouth Growth Board.

Customer and Communities Overview and Scrutiny Panel

This section highlights the work, challenges and successes of the Customers and Communities Overview and Scrutiny Panel in 2012-2013



Looking back on the past year

The panel has met on six occasions in the year 2012 – 2013, whilst also convening on seven occasions as the ‘Social Fund Replacement and Library Modernisation Task and Finish groups’.

The achievements of the Customer and Communities Overview and Scrutiny Panel over the past year have been categorised into four separate categories:

- Strategy and Policy development
- Reducing Inequality
- Improving Service Delivery
- Partnership and Stakeholder working

Strategy and Policy Development

Library Modernisation task and finish completed.

Reducing Inequality

Social Fund replacement task and finish completed.

Correspondence sent to local MP's regarding Clause 5 of the Growth and Infrastructure Bill.

Improving Service Delivery

Life Centre/leisure management contract monitoring undertaken

Reducing noise nuisance updates received

Tenancy Strategy consultation updates received

Partnership and Stakeholder working

Police Crime Panels/Commissioner updates received

End of year crime statistics received

Safe and Strong minutes received.

Looking forward to next year

In 2013 – 2014 municipal year the scrutiny panel will seek to improve services for all Plymouth's citizens by working in partnership with Cabinet Members, Senior Officers and external stakeholders and scrutinising issues including:

- Compact task and finish
- Receiving quarterly updates on the Crime Panel/Commissioner and associated statistics;
- Receiving quarterly updates on the Social Fund Replacement scheme;
- Receiving quarterly updates on the library modernisation programme;
- The panel will attempt to establish improved partnership working with other agencies and bodies to champion further the city's customer and communities agenda and further improve its alliance with the Plymouth Safe and Strong Board.

Growth and Prosperity Overview and Scrutiny Panel

This section highlights the work, challenges and successes of the Growth and Prosperity Overview and Scrutiny Panel in 2012-2013.



Looking back on the past year

Strategy and Policy Development

The Panel focussed primarily on policy and strategy changes that impacted on the Planning department and planning laws during 2012 – 2013.

The panel was informed at the beginning of the year that the Planning department would be exploring ways to effectively engage the public, whilst reducing costs and improving standards. This new approach was presented to the panel and it was commented that the new approach advocated in the Code of Publicity was welcomed and supported.

The panel identified the need to review the Council's application of the Market Recovery Scheme (MRS). Following an update on the MRS the panel were satisfied that future legislative changes, which included the Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL), would replace most of the existing Section 106 obligations and mean that the MRS would no longer be necessary or legally possible.

The panel received an update on Government proposals to change the planning system; this incorporated the proposed changes to permitted development rights and the Growth and Infrastructure Bill. The panel were

concerned that proposals could have a detrimental impact on the economic productivity in some local areas and the provision to modify or discharge affordable housing arrangements could significantly impact local communities.

In order to mitigate the impact on local communities the panel provided comments to the Assistant Director for Planning, to include in the Council's response to the Government Consultation on proposed changes to the planning system.

The panel identified that the Customers and Communities OSP should review the impact of modification or discharge of affordable housing requirements secured through Section 106 agreements, in the Growth and Infrastructure Bill, to determine the impact this may have on local communities. This was recommended to the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board and subsequently referred to Customers and Communities OSP on 12 December 2012.

Championing Growth in the City

The panel has had a keen role to play in promoting and championing growth in the city in 2012 – 2013 and has regularly invited Economic Development Officers to provide updates at meetings. The panel's main focus in its role of championing growth has

involved updates from the Plymouth City Centre Company (PCCC), the city's broadband connectivity improvements and the city's 'Plan for Jobs'.

In respect of the PCCC members advocated the possibility of hosting a monthly market and the role that Plymouth College of Art and Design were playing in utilising vacant city centre stores to promote and market local students' work.

Members were encouraged by the work on-going in the city to improve Broadband Connectivity, however, there were concerns identified in respect of social elements around broadband speeds and usage. This issue was agreed to continue to be reviewed by the panel.

Unemployment was an issue that the panel identified in 2011 – 2012, particularly for young people. A task and finish group was organised to look into this in early 2012 with the issue remaining on the panel's work programme for 2012 – 2013. The panel received updates on the recommendations agreed as part of the 'Youth Unemployment' task and finish group. To further scrutinise the issue of employment the panel considered the city's employment initiative the 'Plan for Jobs'.

The panel endorsed the 'Plan for Jobs' initiative and were satisfied with its current achievements. In order to continue to champion growth and employment in the city the panel have agreed to continue to review the 'Plan for Jobs' initiative in 2013-2014 to ensure that progress against its implementation is monitored.

Improving Service Delivery

Improvements to services offering benefits to the city and its citizens were key objectives for the panel in the delivery of effective scrutiny during 2012 – 2013. Throughout the year the panel has been involved in scrutinising a number of

highways related matters and public transport provisions.

The panel has regularly reviewed and monitored the East End Transport Scheme and through active scrutiny of this issue ensured that:

- local ward councillors were offered the opportunity to communicate local issues to the Transport department;
- Transport Officers reviewed current arrangements to improve congestions issues;
- Councillors were involved in the gathering of intelligence and improvements to public consultation on the Transport Scheme.

The Chair and Vice-Chair of the panel in consultation with the Cabinet Member for Transport and Transport Officers reviewed the charging for road closures and agreed a list of historic events where road closures would be funded by Plymouth City Council. The agreed list was to be taken as a delegated decision by the Cabinet Member for Transport and would be subject to annual review by the Economic Development department.

As part of an in-depth task and finish group on 'Subsidised Bus Routes and Through Ticketing' members sought the views of stakeholders including local bus operators, Travel Watch South West and representatives of the Youth Cabinet and Senior Citizen's Forum. The review took place over four days and the recommendations drew attention to the Green Travel Pass Scheme, the need for greater certainty in offering lengthier subsidised contracts to bus operators and the best practice of Oxford City Council in their local transport arrangements.

The recommendations were accepted by Cabinet, subject to one amendment, and it was commented that the quality of the task and finish group's work demonstrated the

value of pre-decision scrutiny. The Growth and Prosperity Overview and Scrutiny Panel would review the implementation of the agreed recommendations in 2013 – 2014.

Partnership and Stakeholder working

During 2012 – 2013 the Growth and Prosperity Overview and Scrutiny Panel recognised the importance of building relations and being better informed of the work undertaken by other bodies in relation to developing the city's growth agenda, in particular, the panel aimed to develop alliances and knowledge gathering from the Plymouth Growth Board and the Heart of the South West Local Enterprise Partnership (LEP).

The panel's knowledge of the work undertaken by the Plymouth Growth Board has improved through regularly reviewing the Growth Board minutes at panel meetings. This has better informed the panel of this Growth Boards role and also ensured an effective form of governance and scrutiny of the city's growth agenda.

The development of the Heart of the South West: Local Enterprise Partnership, which is a new strategic partnership organisation formed under the leadership of the private sector and supported by the local authorities in the South West to create a powerful economic alliance, has been of keen interest to the panel this year. The panel invited Tim Jones, Chairman of the LEP to a meeting and offered a challenging question and answer session in order to ensure that the LEP was aiming to deliver appropriate growth in the city. The panel were pleased with the work of the LEP and endorsed its intentions by recommending

to the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board that Plymouth City Council continues to work with the LEP, as well as other partners within its sub-region, in the interests of the city around major strategic issues such as the City Deal and transportation, and in order to support local businesses accessing LEP influenced or controlled funding streams.

Looking forward to next year

In 2013 – 2014 municipal year the scrutiny panel will seek to promote the growth of the city further and improve services for all Plymouth's citizens by working in partnership with Cabinet Members, Senior Officers and external stakeholders and scrutinising issues including:

- Unemployment, with a particular emphasis on Young People.
- The City Council's 'Plan for Jobs'.
- The City Council's city-wide growth strategy, the 'Plymouth Plan'.
- The role and influence of the LEP on Plymouth.
- The City's connectivity;
- Improvements to the city's highways network, in particular, the East End Transport Scheme.
- The Plymouth Hospitals NHS Trust's commitment to support the city's growth agenda.

The panel will attempt to establish improved partnership working with other organisations, agencies and bodies to champion further the city's growth agenda, and further improve its alliance with the Plymouth Growth Board.

Health and Adult Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Panel

This section highlights the work, challenges and successes of the Health and Adult Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Panel in 2012-2013.



Looking back on the past year

The Health and Social Care landscape has been subject to significant change over the last year. In particular the publication of the Health and Social Care Act 2012 made a number of changes to the structure of health services both at a local and national level, changes to the discharge of statutory health scrutiny functions and sought to strengthen the voice of the patient and bring democratic legitimacy to health services.

Strategy and Policy Development

With the background of the increasingly complex health service landscape and continued move toward self-responsibility and personalisation within the Social Care setting the panel has had a heavy work programme and have been able to scrutinise key local and national policy drivers.

The panel has taken a role of scrutinising the development of the Health and Wellbeing board, a key part of the Health and Social Care Act 2012. The Panel received regular updates on the development of the board and received a presentation and copy of an early draft of the Joint Health and Wellbeing Strategy. The panel has supported the development process of the Board and the key principles of co-design, early intervention and best

use of resources that underpin it. The panel pledged to continue to support the work of the board and made specific recommendations concerning the development of a health and wellbeing impact assessment for council reports, along similar lines of the equalities impact assessment which currently accompanies reports making their way through the democratic process.

The Health and Social Care Act 2012 abolishes local Primary Care Trusts and replaces them with Clinical Commissioning Groups. The panel has met with the Chair of the local Clinical Commissioning Group and monitored its authorisation process. The Act also transferred responsibility for public health to the local authority and the panel monitored the transition plans.

Changes to Health Scrutiny functions were proposed in the Health and Social Care Act. The department of Health published a consultation on proposed changes to health scrutiny functions before the regulations were published by the secretary of state. The panel responded to the consultation, alongside other local authorities, to challenge some of the proposals which were later removed.

Following the scandal at Mid-Staffordshire NHS Foundation Trust, the subsequent Francis Inquiry and recommendations the

panel and agreed that the work of the health scrutiny function should reduce its focus on strategic issues and further increase the scrutiny of service delivery across the health and social care sector.

Improving Service Delivery

Members of the panel were contacted by members of the public regarding a decision by the local acute trust to close the Maternity Acupuncture Service. Members invited those with concerns to attend the panel and present issues for discussion. The panel made recommendations to further investigate the totality of maternity provision which would be actioned in the new municipal year.

Never Events

Are serious, largely preventable patient safety incidents that should not occur if the available preventative measures have been implemented. Unfortunately our local acute trust had experienced a number of never events over the last municipal year. The panel has reacted by inviting the trust to attend the panel on a number of occasions to provide the panel with information surrounding the events. As a result of the most recent never events the panel contacted the Health Scrutiny Panel at Staffordshire County Council to share some learning from their recent experiences with the Mid-Staffordshire NHS Foundation Trust and the Francis Inquiry. As a result the Panel has recommended that Health Accountability Sessions are established based on a model employed at Staffordshire County Council. This will ensure that patients, public and other stakeholders are able to comment and hold all health providers to account. The sessions will attempt to assure the public that system and processes are in place to ensure the safest and highest standards of care.

The availability and suitability of parking at Derriford Hospital has remained an issue for the panel. Although the issue could be

seen as trivial the impact of poor parking on users, who may be disabled or in a distressed or vulnerable state can be negative. The panel have considered changes from the Hospital and invited comments from interested groups such as the Local Involvement Network and Plymouth Area Disability Action Network. The panel was able to ensure that groups were able to make site visits to the Hospital and were fully consulted with regards to any changes of parking provision.

At the panel's first meeting of the year annual 'Quality Accounts' were considered by the panel. The production of quality accounts is a statutory responsibility for all health service providers and the panel must be invited to make comment on the accounts. In 2012 – 13 the panel made comments on all of the required quality accounts, including a private sector provider who offers diagnostic services on behalf of the National Health Service.

Partnership and Stakeholder working

The panel considered the issue of 'Regional Pay' in September 2012. The panel carried out this scrutiny session with colleagues from across the peninsula and had elected representatives from Devon County Council, Torbay Council and Cornwall Council in attendance. The panel invited a number of interested parties to discuss future proposals for NHS regional pay which included Plymouth University, Plymouth Chamber of Commerce, The Royal College of Nurses and The Royal College of Midwives, the British Medical Association, Trade Unions and Plymouth Hospitals NHS Trust. The meeting resulted in a number of recommendations to the South West Pay Terms and Conditions Consortium and Plymouth Hospitals NHS Trust which have been accepted. The panel's work in this area ensured a public debate on the issue and contributed to the proposals currently being considered by the Plymouth Hospitals NHS Trust.

Plymouth Health and Adult Social Care Panel was one of 14 local authorities to be selected to take part in a scrutiny development programme on the health reforms established by the Centre for Public Scrutiny (CfPS). CfPS received funding from the Department of Health to help support accountability through council scrutiny as the health system was in transition following the Health and Social Care Act 2012. The panel developed their own relationships and ways of working to provide a contribution to a national publication which can be found at the following link - <http://tinyurl.com/ctewbzs> The panel has begun to develop a closer relationship with neighbouring health scrutiny functions. A peninsula health scrutiny officer group started to meet in 2012 and explore where there can be efficiencies in scrutinising shared health services together. The panel continues to be represented at regional and national health scrutiny network events.

Looking forward to next year

In 2013 – 2014 municipal year the Council's Health Scrutiny Function will be

required to refocus efforts on the scrutiny of service delivery in light of the Francis Report and The Health and Social Care Act 2012. The panel will seek to provide assurance to the public that changes to health and social care structures are effective and do not risk but improve local healthcare services. The panel will continue to work with partners in the City, across the peninsula and nationally to ensure that the scrutiny of local health and social care services result in better outcomes for citizens. Some issues that could be carried over into the new municipal year include –

- Hospital Discharge Process
- Mental Health Recovery Pathways

The panel will continue to improve partnership working with other agencies and bodies, including the Health and Wellbeing Board, will champion the early intervention agenda, and further improve its alliance with the Health and Wellbeing Board.

Support Services Overview and Scrutiny Panel

This report highlights the work, challenges and successes of the Support Services Overview and Scrutiny Panel in 2012-2013.



Looking back over the past year

Revenue and Benefits

The panel scrutinised the revenues and benefits, customer service and transaction centre review in Feb 2012 and then continued to monitor the progress throughout the year by way of monthly update reports and more in depth challenges at business meetings.

Staff Sickness Absence

The panel monitored the sickness absence on several occasions throughout the year and challenged officers on in depth reports provided at business meetings.

Shared Services

The panel monitored the shared services business plan on several occasions over the year.

Freedom of Information

The panel heard about the action plan to address the fact that the council is not current meeting its freedom of information targets.



Looking forward to next year

In 2013 – 2014 municipal year the scrutiny panel will seek to continue to closely monitor staff sickness absence, as this remains a key area of work for the council.

In order to avoid costly fines, the targets set for the Freedom of Information requests will continue to be closely monitored.

Membership of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board and Panels

Overview and Scrutiny Management Board	Growth and Prosperity OSP	Customers and Communities OSP
 <p>Chair – Councillor Mary Aspinall</p>	 <p>Chair – Councillor Patrick Nicholson</p>	 <p>Chair – Councillor Ian Tuffin</p>
 <p>Vice-Chair – Councillor Ian Tuffin</p>	 <p>Councillor Jean Nelder</p>	 <p>Councillor Michael Leaves</p>
Councillor Sally Bowie	Councillor Mary Aspinall	Councillor Richard Ball
Councillor Ian Bowyer	Councillor Danny Damarell	Councillor Alison Casey
Councillor Alison Casey	Councillor Ian Darcy	Councillor Danny Damarell
Councillor Philippa Davey	Councillor Mike Fox	Councillor Philippa Davey
Councillor David James	Councillor Martin Leaves	Councillor David Haydon
Councillor Grant Monahan	Councillor Michael Leaves	Councillor Paul Jarvis
Councillor Pauline Murphy	Councillor John Smith	Councillor Glenn Jordan
Councillor Jean Nelder	Councillor George Wheeler	Councillor Martin Leaves
Councillor Patrick Nicholson	Councillor Kevin Wiggins	Councillor Steven Ricketts
Councillor Kevin Wiggins		

Children and Young People OSP	Health and Adult Social Care OSP	Support Services OSP
 <p>Chair – Councillor Sally Bowie</p>	 <p>Chair – Councillor Mary Aspinall</p>	 <p>Chair – Councillor Pauline Murphy</p>
 <p>Vice-Chair – Councillor Sam Leaves</p>	 <p>Councillor Grant Monahan</p>	 <p>Councillor Ian Bowyer</p>
<p>Councillor Terri Beer</p>	<p>Councillor Lynda Bowyer</p>	<p>Councillor Alison Casey</p>
<p>Councillor Tom Browne</p>	<p>Councillor Mike Fox</p>	<p>Councillor Nigel Churchill</p>
<p>Councillor Sam Davey</p>	<p>Councillor Ian Gordon</p>	<p>Councillor Ian Gordon</p>
<p>Councillor Glenn Jordan</p>	<p>Councillor David James</p>	<p>Councillor David James</p>
<p>Councillor Eddie Rennie</p>	<p>Councillor Dr John Mahony</p>	<p>Councillor Martin Leaves</p>
<p>Councillor Chaz Singh</p>	<p>Councillor Patricia Nicholson</p>	<p>Councillor Lorraine Parker</p>
<p>Councillor David Stark</p>	<p>Councillor Lorraine Parker</p>	<p>Councillor Eddie Rennie</p>
<p>Councillor Kate Taylor</p>	<p>Councillor Jon Taylor</p>	<p>Councillor David Stark</p>
<p>Councillor Tina Tuohy</p>	<p>Councillor Ian Tuffin</p>	<p>Councillor Bill Stevens</p>

This page is intentionally left blank